#### ANDREW L. PACKARD

319 PLEASANT STREET, PETALUMA, CALIFORNIA 94952
PHONE (707) 763-7227 FAX (707) 763-9227
INFO@PACKARDLAWOFFICES.COM

August 31, 2009

## VIA CERTIFIED MAIL

Mr. Scott Rudolph, Chairman & Chief Executive Officer NBTY, Inc. 2100 Smithtown Avenue Ronkonkoma, NY 11779

Re: Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.

Dear Sir,

This firm represents Stephen D. Gillett in connection with this notice of violations of California's Safe Drinking Water & Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. (also referred to as "Proposition 65"). This letter serves to provide notification of these violations to you and to the public enforcement agencies.

Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, Mr. Gillett intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations. A summary of the statute and its implementing regulations, which was prepared by the lead agency designated under the statute, is enclosed with the copy of this notice served upon the violator. The specific details of the violations that are the subject of this notice are provided below.

The name of the violator covered by this notice is NBTY, Inc. (hereafter, the "Violator"). The Violator manufactures, markets, distributes and/or sells in California herbal dietary supplements. These ongoing violations arise out of exposures to lead and lead compounds from the following herbal dietary supplement product(s):

Ginger Root
Ginseng Complex with Royal E Jelly
Black Cohosh

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a substance known to cause reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of

Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. August 31, 2009 Page 2

California officially listed lead and lead compounds as a substance known to cause cancer.

Route of exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of these products by consumers. Accordingly, consumer exposures have occurred and continue to occur primarily through the ingestion route, but also may occur through the inhalation and/or and dermal contact routes of exposure.

**Duration of violations.** Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day since at least August 31, 2008, as well as every day since the products were introduced in the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users.

In keeping with the public interest goals of the statute and my client's objectives in issuing this notice, Mr. Gillett is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter. Such resolution will avoid both further unwarned consumer exposures to lead and additional fees and costs incurred by the parties. Mr. Gillett's address is Post Office Box 170142, San Francisco, California 94117. Tel. (415) 850-5233. However, he has retained this firm in the matter; all communications regarding this Notice of Violation may be directed to my attention at the above-listed firm address and telephone number.

Very Truly Yours,

Andrew L. Packard

Attachments:
OEHHA Summary
Certificate of Merit (w/o Attorney General's attachments)
Certificate of Service

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

(Re: Stephen D. Gillett's August 31, 2009 Notice of Proposition 65 Violations Issued to NBTY, INC.)

- I, Andrew L. Packard, declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party in the notice has violated Health & Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: August 31, 2009

Andrew I Packard

Attachments (for Attorney General Copy only)

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 319 Pleasant Street, Petaluma, California 94952.

On August 31, 2009, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986: A SUMMARY"

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

Mr. Scott Rudolph, Chairman & Chief Executive Officer NBTY, Inc.
2100 Smithtown Avenue
Ronkonkoma, NY 11779

On August 31, 2009, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT (including supporting documentation required by Title 11 CCR §3102) on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Post Office Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On August 31, 2009, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION**, **CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelop, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it in a U.S. Postal Service Office for delivery by First Class Mail.

Andrew L. Packard

Executed on August 31, 2009, in Petaluma, California.

- Makindi - Sikirasey, 1 Ji<del>li Amadi</del>) - Pin - Marin Sargot

Placerolle, CA 95607

The Magazahia Pipagate Egge District Augustov France Conse

# Service List (Page 1 of 4)

The Honorable Tom Orloff District Attorney, Alameda County 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable William Richmond District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Todd Riebe District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Michael Ramsey District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Jeffrey Tuttle District Attorney, Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

The Honorable John Poyner District Attorney, Colusa County 547 Market Street Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Robert Kochly
District Attorney, Contra Costa County
725 Court Street
Martinez, CA 94553

The Honorable Michael Riese District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Gary Lacy District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable Elizabeth Egan District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721 The Honorable Robert Holzapfel District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Paul Gallegos District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert G. Otero District Attorney, Imperial County 939 West Main Street El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Arthur Maillet District Attorney, Inyo County Post Office Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Edward R. Jagels District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Ronald Calhoun District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Gerhard Luck District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

The Honorable Robert Burns District Attorney, Lassen County 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130

The Honorable Steve Cooley
District Attorney, Los Angeles County
210 West Temple Street, Rm 345
Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Ernest LiCalsi
District Attorney, Madera County
209 West Yosemite Avenue
Madera, CA 93637

### Service List (Page 2 of 4)

The Honorable Edward Berbarian District Attorney, Marin County 3501 Civic Center, Room 183 San Rafael, CA 94903

The Honorable Robert Brown
District Attorney, Mariposa County
Post Office Box 730
Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable Norman Vroman District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Gordon Spencer District Attorney, Merced County 2222 "M" Street Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Jordan Funk District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street Alturas, CA 96101-4020

The Honorable George Booth District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

The Honorable Dean Flippo District Attorney, Monterey County PO Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93901

The Honorable Gary Lieberstein District Attorney, Napa County 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

The Honorable Michael Ferguson District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Church Street, Suite 8 Nevada City, CA 95959

The Honorable Tory Rackauckas District Attorney, Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701 The Honorable Brad Fenocchio District Attorney, Placer County 11562 "B" Avenue, Dewitt Center Auburn, CA 95603

The Honorable Jeff Cunan District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Grover C. Trask, II District Attorney, Riverside County 4075 Main Street, 1st Floor Riverside, CA 92501

The Honorable Jan Scully
District Attorney, Sacramento County
901 "G" Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable John Sarsfield District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Hollister, CA 95023

The Honorable Michael Ramos District Attorney, San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415-0004

The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Room 1320 San Diego, CA 92112

The Honorable Kamala Harris District Attorney, San Francisco County 850 Bryant Street, Room 325 San Francsico, CA 94103

The Honorable James Willett
District Attorney, San Joaquin County
Post Office Box 990
Stockton, CA 95201
Stockton, CA 95201
Stockton, CA 95201

The Honorable Gerald Shea District Attorney, San Luis Obispo County 1050 Monterey Street, Room 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

### Service List (Page 3 of 4)

The Honorable James P. Fox District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable Thomas W. Sneddon, Jr. District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1105 Santa Barbara Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101

The Honorable George Kennedy District Attorney, Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110

The Honorable Bob Lee District Attorney, Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable Gerald Benito District Attorney, Shasta County 1525 Court Street, Third Floor Redding, CA 96001-1632

The Honorable Lawrence Allen District Attorney, Sierra County Courthouse, Post Office Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable James Andrus District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable David Paulson District Attorney, Solano County 600 Union Avenue Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua District Attorney, Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

The Honorable Jim Brazelton District Attorney, Stanislaus County 800 11<sup>th</sup> Street, Room 200 Modesto, CA 95353

The Honorable Carl V. Adams District Attorney, Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

The Honorable Gregg Cohen District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable David L. Cross District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Phillip Cline District Attorney, Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Avenue, Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291

The Honorable Donald Segerstrom, Jr. District Attorney, Tuolumne County 2 South Green Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Gregory Totten District Attorney, Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

The Honorable David C. Henderson District Attorney, Yolo County 301 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Woodland, CA 95695

The Honorable Patrick McGrath District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

# Service List (Page 4 of 4)

The Honorable Rockard Delgadillo Los Angeles City Attorney's Office Room 1800, City Hall East 200 N. Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Michael Aguirre San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Dennis Herrera San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Richard Doyle San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113